

EXPLANATION

(ETHICS-2)

Maximum Marks :250

Q.1.(a) "It is not always the same thing to be a good person and a good citizen." Explain the meaning of this statement and analyse its implications for a democratic society.

“अच्छा व्यक्ति होना और अच्छा नागरिक होना सदैव सामान बात नहीं होती है”। इस कथन के अर्थ की व्याख्या कीजिए और लोकतांत्रिक समाज के लिए इसके निहितार्थों का विश्लेषण कीजिए।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Explain the difference between good man and good citizen.
- Discuss its implication of the difference on society.
- Provide examples for providing more clarity in answer.

Answer:

The good man and the good citizen are not the same. What can be said for one cannot be necessarily said about the other. It is an essential for the good man to be a good citizen. It is not though vital for the good citizen to be a good man. This distinction is important to make, because it helps one understand that the qualities a good man possesses far super cede those a good citizen.

Concept of Good citizen

A good citizen does what is best for the community, city and country. As long he follows the law of the land and doesn't harm his surrounding and cares for its betterment, he is a good citizen. A good citizen is loyal to his land and government. The virtue of the citizen must be suited to his constitution. Since there are different constitutions and laws in different law, the conception of a good citizen varies. This analysis was put forward by Aristotle. It depends on the political regime under which the citizen lives. A good citizen in Hitler's regime would be considered as a bad citizen elsewhere. Thus good citizen is relative to the regime.

Concept of Good man

On the other hand, conception of good man is same anywhere in the world. A good man must acquire universal human values such as honesty, empathy, compassion, courage, etc. The good man is superior then a good citizen. His soul is well ordered.

The important implication of this difference for modern democracies is that law must be moral. This will remove any gap between the expected behaviour from a good man and a good citizen. The law in modern democracies must help citizen build his character. For example law prohibiting liquor, prostitution etc help citizen develop negative attitude towards these social evils.

(b) There can be honesty without integrity, but no integrity without honesty. Do you agree? Justify your stand with examples.

सत्यनिष्ठा के बिना ईमानदारी संभव है, किंतु ईमानदारी के बिना सत्यनिष्ठा संभव नहीं है। क्या आप इससे सहमत हैं? उदाहरण सहित अपने मत का औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Explain the meaning of honesty and integrity.
- Explain how they are related, which is more important and why.
- Give examples.

Answer:

Honesty and Integrity are often considered to be synonymous but they differ in their meanings. Integrity offers a more holistic approach, which is living by strict ethical principles and conduct.

An honest person has the following traits:-

- Open and just in dealing with others;
- Straightforwardness of conduct, along with the absence of lying, cheating, theft, etc.
- Trustworthy, loyal, fair and sincere.

However, Integrity means adherence to principles. It is a three-step process:

- Choosing the right course of conduct;

- Acting consistently with the choice—even when it is inconvenient or unprofitable to do
- Openly declaring where one stands.

Accordingly, integrity is equated with moral reflection, steadfastness to commitments, trustworthiness. Here it is similar to its approach to 'honesty'.

The major difference between honesty and integrity is that one may be entirely honest without engaging in the thought and reflection that integrity demands.

For instance, a person maybe honest and loyal to his superior but helps him indulge in malicious activities. Here, the sincerity of the person has personal benefits. He has compromised the dignity of the office and therefore lacks integrity.

Honesty can exist without Integrity because Integrity means consistently behaving in an open, fair, and transparent manner; honouring one's commitments; and works to uphold the Public Service Values.

Integrity cannot exist without honesty because integrity involves;

- Provides honest and frank opinion to uphold public interest.
- Trustworthy in all circumstances.
- Full disclosure, by sharing the political implications of the decisions being made.
- Creates a culture that encourages open, honest and ethical behaviour.
- Treats people impartially, regardless of political, social, demographic, geographic, circumstances or Bias.

In any circumstances, a person with integrity always upholds the value of honesty automatically.

Q.2.(a) What does inequality mean to you? What are the different kinds of inequality? Is inequality morally wrong?

असमानता से आप क्या समझते हैं? असमानता के विभिन्न प्रकार क्या हैं? क्या असमानता नैतिक रूप से गलत है?

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Give a value neutral explanation of your understanding of inequality.
- Explain different types of inequality with natural, social, economic and political dimensions of it, along with examples.
- Argue that inequality of opportunity and status is wrong, as the constitution also provides for equality of opportunity and freedom from any discrimination.

Answer:

Inequality can simply be defined, in a value neutral way, as difference or gap in capacity, resources, circumstances, degree or any other thing or quality, of what is available to one in relation to another.

There can be different kinds of inequalities:

- **Social Inequality:** Herein people do not enjoy same social status and some or many undergo discrimination on the basis of class, caste, race religion, sex, place of origin etc. Baba Saheb Ambedkar was against any social discrimination and our constitution has provided us safeguard against the same.
- **Political Inequality:** When all the citizens being governed under one rule are provided different rights of political participation. Our constitution provides everybody equal political rights and adult franchise to each above 18 years of age, although in ancient societies like Ancient Greece political rights were restricted to men of wealth and property only.
- **Natural Inequality:** It is the nature, that any human being is bound to be different from another in many ways. No two individuals can be same. These natural differences can be on the basis of gender, race, place of birth etc, but these natural differences should not become hindrances in human development and realization in any way. There should be equality of opportunity, political, social and economical to all irrespective to these natural inequalities.
- **Inequality of capacity:** Although some thinkers believed that everybody is more or less born equal, some are endowed in bodily strength and some in mental but others believe that there is difference in people's capacity, and everybody should be equally incapacitated.
- **Inequality of Resources or economic inequality:** Some may have more resources than others, but Marx has spoken of making an attempt towards equality of resources, while capitalists advocate equality of opportunity rather than equality of resources.

Morality of Inequality

There are some basic differences inherent in nature, yet these differences should not become basis for inequality of opportunities, treatment, distribution and social political and economic status. Hence, natural inequalities are inevitable and not morally wrong as such, but perpetuating social, political and economic inequality by discriminating on the basis of these differences is morally questionable.

Even the Constitution of our country stands for equality of opportunity and status for all, The constitution also provide for equality before law and equal protection of law and prohibits discrimination on the grounds of caste, religion, sex etc. Hence inequality created by denying individuals equality of opportunity is morally wrong.

(b) Competition, it is argued, spurs the best of performance, however, can it also instigate cheating and unethical behaviour? Discuss with adequate examples.

यह तर्क दिया जाता है कि प्रतियोगिता सर्वोत्तम प्रदर्शन की प्रेरणा देती है, लेकिन क्या यह धोखाधड़ी और अनैतिक व्यवहार के लिए भी प्रेरित कर सकती है? पर्याप्त उदाहरणों के साथ चर्चा कीजिए

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Start with the importance of competition in different spheres of life.
- Now discuss how excessive competition can lead to cheating citing examples.
- Conclude your answer with the way forward.

Answer:

It is well accepted that competition is desirable since it improves functioning of markets, guarantees efficiency and reduces possibilities of discriminatory behaviour of employers. However, many studies suggest that competition may favour unethical behaviour such as corruption and cheating. For example:

- Status of a person is judged by his wealth irrespective of the means he adopts to garner it. Lured to gather more assets in minimum time, such people indulge in corrupt practices. They cheat and misuse the loopholes of administrative machinery.
- Recently cases of plagiarism as well as forged research results in academia and doping scandals etc.
- Industries indulge in child labour, "excessive" executive pay, corporate earnings manipulation to corner maximum profits for themselves.
- Competition emphasises the importance of personal success at the cost of wellbeing of a group and thereby lessens the social cohesion. Individuals thereby may find it 'legitimate' to gain and enhance their personal share by cheating.
- One might argue that with proper monitoring mechanisms and punishment schemes one can put a check on ever expanding cases of cheating in almost every conceivable sphere. However, it becomes impossible when the monitoring and punishing agencies themselves form nexus with the cheaters.

Hence, the approach should be towards such an education system which builds a strong moral belief system within a person since his childhood. The child must be able to withstand such allurements and have courage to take a strong stand. Results (ends) should not be the sole basis of evaluation of successes and failures but the efforts (means) should also be as essential. Gandhiji has emphasised that genuine education lies in developing character, inculcating internal virtues.

In India a large asymmetry exists – information, money etc. Such asymmetries make it a very fertile ground for cheating. A strong set of moral principle system is desirable and essential condition to achieve sustainable and inclusive development.

Q.3.(a) What do you mean by 'anonymity in the civil services'? Explain why anonymity and neutrality are considered as important traits for civil servants.

सिविल सेवा में अवैयक्तित्व से आपका क्या आशय है? व्याख्या कीजिए कि क्यों अवैयक्तित्व और तटस्थता सिविल सेवकों के लिए महत्वपूर्ण लक्षण माने जाते हैं।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- First explain the meaning of 'anonymity in the civil services'. Give examples in this context.
- Explain why traits like anonymity and neutrality are important in civil services.

Answer:

The convention of ministerial responsibility requires that minister, not civil servants, accept responsibility to parliament for their actions and those of their departments. A bureaucrat is supposed to work behind the curtain and avoid media limelight and public gaze. This is called anonymity in civil services.

Principle of neutrality implies that a civil servant is not committed to any political party or ideology. He offers his aid and advice without any bias or affiliations. They are restricted from taking part in party politics even outside of their professional roles. Thus, they execute duties in accordance to laws and regulations.

In return of anonymity and neutrality a civil servant is ensured a permanent career which is not enjoyed by political executive.

Importance of anonymity and neutrality in civil services:

Anonymity

- It allows civil servant to not fall for political compulsions and public sentiments but be rational in his decisions and actions.

He is not worried about various pressure groups. He quietly works in the background in public interest.

It allows them to advice to ministers freely and without fear of any adverse public or political reactions and without fear of damage to their future careers.

Neutrality

- It ensures continuity in policies. The government may change but the civil servant will continue advising in public interest.
- For a layman politician, it ensures that he is getting free and fair advice in public interest not any other considerations.
- It ensures smooth transition from one to other government and is one of the reasons that Army had never to intervene.
- Public confidence in civil services is maintained and it is assured that irrespective of political party the government will be run on the basis of constitutional provisions.

However, the principles of anonymity and neutrality aiming at efficiency in public services have been wrongly interpreted and have now become of source of inefficiency and corruption:

- Anonymity has been used by civil servant to shed accountability and refusal to be held responsible even for their malaise action. They have derelicted duty and hid behind the cloak of ministerial responsibility for their collusion in corruption citing anonymity. He is liable for his actions and anonymity cannot be an excuse. In the 2G scam case supreme court held that telecom secretary cannot hide behind anonymity to defend his malafide inaction,
- In recent years, this anonymity has begun to be eroded. The level of media interest in government affairs tends to identify individual senior civil servants.
- Select Committees, which scrutinise the activities of government departments, frequently question civil servants about the advice they give to ministers.
- Political neutrality has often been interpreted as policy neutrality by civil servants. They often do not seek better policy. They affiliate with political parties to ensure their personal interests. But are apathetic to public and the deprived sections citing neutrality.
- Rise of service politicians i.e. civil servants joining politics in recent times has hurt the principles of anonymity and neutrality. It does not augur well for an independent civil services committed to public cause.

(b) What are the various sources through which humans can judge the correctness of their actions? In the context of public life discuss how these sources are important in offering a clear and practical guidance.

वे विभिन्न स्रोत क्या हैं जिनके माध्यम से मनुष्य अपने कृत्यों के औचित्य का परीक्षण कर सकता है? चर्चा कीजिए कि सार्वजनिक जीवन के संदर्भ में स्पष्ट और व्यवहारिक मार्गदर्शन प्रदान करने में ये स्रोत किस प्रकार महत्वपूर्ण हैं?

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Discuss rules, regulations and conscience as sources by which humans can judge the correctness of their actions.
- Discuss their role in public life.
- Conclude by emphasizing the desirability of these sources in ethical decision making.

Answer:

Laws and conscience are the two sources of guidance by which human beings can judge the morality of their actions. These sources are particularly important to public administrators in offering a clear and practical guidance.

1) Law, rules and regulations

Laws have a moral connotation. It induces people to act or restrains them from acting and imposes an obligation. It must not only be just, but also burdens equally. Also, it is for common, not private good. Regulations often help clarify laws. Unlike laws, rules need not be for the common good and can be for the private good. For example, rules made within an organization for efficient utilization of resources etc.

2) Conscience

It is a person's moral sense of right and wrong, viewed as acting as a guide to one's behavior. Law states a general rule concerning actions; conscience lays down a practical rule for specific action. Conscience applies the law or rule to specific actions; therefore it is wider than law.

Importance in offering a clear and practical guidance

In considering right and wrong, public administrators have at their disposal information on the nature of the action performed or about to be performed, the circumstances surrounding the action and the purpose of the action. Laws, rules and regulations provide additional guidance to these.

Sometimes rules circumvent what the civil law clearly states. While a superior can punish a subordinate for violating such rules, if the rule is contrary to civil or natural law, the violator may have acted ethically. Hence, rules violating natural or civil laws should be avoided.

It is often recognized that rules and regulations alone are insufficient for public administrators. Without a conscience to apply those laws and rules to particular actions, public administrators miss a critical element. Conscience helps in applying the laws, rules and other criteria of morality to specific actions.

All public administrators have to make discretionary decisions where conscience plays an important role.

Q.4.(a) Should a person resort to leaking of information in case of wrongs done in the organization ? Does it cause a conflict of interest between the personal, organizational and societal spheres? Discuss with examples.

क्या संगठन में की गई गलतियों के संबंध में व्यक्ति को सूचना लीक करनी चाहिए? क्या यह व्यक्तिगत, संगठनात्मक और सामाजिक क्षेत्रों के बीच हितों का टकराव पैदा करता है? उदाहरण सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

The question has two subparts:

- In the first part of the answer, discuss the ethicality of leaking information in case of wrong happening in the organization.
- In the second part, clearly mention the issue of conflict of interest from personal, organizational and societal point of view. Substantiate your answer with relevant examples.

Answer:

An employee possesses prima facie duties of loyalty and confidentiality to their employers and that leaking information cannot be justified except on the basis of a higher duty to the public good.

However, it is important to recognize that in any relationship which demands loyalty works both ways and involves mutual enrichment. Hence, employee holds the obligation only when the organization is not cheating the employees in return for their selfish needs

The first step of action should be to attempt to reintroduce the system of checks and balance in the organization.

Leaking information should be taken as the last resort when all other avenues have exhausted.

Conflict of Interest

The employee may feel a moral duty to expose any serious misconduct, dishonesty, or illegal activity that he discovers in an organization, especially when such conduct directly threatens the public interest.

It takes a huge amount of bravery to leak information as the list of negative consequences to this act includes broken promises to fix the problem, disillusionment, isolation, humiliation, loss of job, questioning of the whistleblower's mental health, vindictive tactics to make the individual's work more difficult and/or insignificant, assassination of character, formal reprimand, and difficult court proceedings.

The person is divided between loyalty to their employer and their moral commitment to the law and society at large. They have strong reasoning that the work that they are doing is subversive to their personal as well as public intents. They feel cheated by the firm thinking that this is not what they intend to do.

Leaking information is driven by self-interest, altruism and strong moral attitude towards the cause. As the personal cost of leaking information is very high, including legal battles separation, the person must feel strongly about the cause. They take personal responsibility when they feel that legality and morality are beginning to separate and public interest is suffering in the process.

There should be independent agencies staffed by civil liberties where the whistleblowers can report the cases without hesitation and can be ensured an unbiased investigation.

(b) A broad ethical framework as a guiding light for international relations will not only ensure harmonious relations between nations but will also lead to progress of the human race. Discuss with examples.

अंतर्राष्ट्रीय संबंधों के लिए प्रकाश स्तंभ के रूप में एक व्यापक नैतिक ढांचा न केवल राष्ट्रों के बीच सामंजस्यपूर्ण संबंध सुनिश्चित करेगा बल्कि मानव जाति का विकास भी सुनिश्चित करेगा। उदाहरण सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Highlight, with examples, the ethical dimensions in international relations.
- Discuss how an ethical framework can act as a guiding light for harmonious relations.
- Conclude with overall impact on people of such ethics based relations between nations. Examples from climate change or nuclear arms or trade pacts negotiation can be given.

Answer:

Relations between sovereign states are largely historical in nature. However, economic and strategic considerations have led to formation of new and often opportunistic alliances in recent past. In international forums, countries mostly negotiate in groups based on their own perception of what is good – economically or strategically, for them. This approach ignores the larger ethical framework to take decisions which may be good in the long term for all and rather relies on short term good for a few. A broad ethical framework for international relations can be framed keeping the following principals at hand:

- Equity, Justice and Human Dignity should form the bedrock of international negotiations, conventions, agreements, treaties and protocols.
- Upholding these values in face of adversities like economic turmoil, climate change or terror must inform the decisions taken. Issues must be resolved morally and not merely politically.
- Equally important is transparency, which makes the whole decision making process more acceptable.
- Cooperation between nations is crucial as number of human lives depend up on success/failure of decision. As such, early and time-bound conclusion of negotiations should be adhered to.
- The international community has a responsibility to assist the state to fulfill its primary responsibility of protecting its citizens (As envisaged in Responsibility to Protect (R2P) in UN resolution).
- For e.g., failure to reach consensus on Syrian conflict has led to loss of number of lives; Climate change negotiations have produced too little too late, the result of which is imminent threat of drowning faced by Pacific Island Nations. Similarly, national anti-corruption measures need reinforcement at the international level with mutual assistance and cooperation.

Examples:

Challenge	Ethical Solutions
1. Terrorism:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Promote inter-faith dialogue; ● Adopt a multicultural approach; ● Emphasize secular values like peace, truth, tolerance, honesty, non-violence,
2. Climate Change: Exploitation of resources; luxury v/s survival;	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Equitable distribution of responsibilities. ● Sustainable development through Recycling, Reuse, Optimisation and conservation.
3. Poverty and Financial Instability: Socio-economic inequalities, insensitivity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Issues must be discussed at international forums like WTO, UN. ● Unilateral/Multilateral actions should be discouraged.
4. Disarmament : Morality of	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Encouragement of principle of peace, harmony, love and

nuclear weapons, non-violence	compassion • Cooperation should give precedence over competition
5. Organized Crime, Drugs, Human Trafficking	• Dignity of human life should be upheld under all costs with zero tolerance for crime. • Mutual assistance

By overcoming these challenges through the principles of ethics, number of lives can be positively changed. Decisions based on ethical principles are more logical and easy to accept. However, political considerations at home usually mar the ability of negotiators to arrive at them. Taking the opposition parties, private entities, NGOs, etc, in confidence through transparency can remove these hurdles.

Q.5.(a) Ensuring accountability in the administration just adds another layer in the bureaucratic process.

Examine. Differentiate between accountability and responsibility. Suggest some measures through which administrative accountability can be made more effective in India.

प्रशासन में जवाबदेही सुनिश्चित करना नौकरशाही प्रक्रिया में एक और स्तर को जोड़ देता है। परीक्षण कीजिए। जवाबदेही और उत्तरदायित्व के बीच अंतर स्पष्ट कीजिए। कुछ ऐसे उपाय बताइए जिससे भारत में प्रशासनिक जवाबदेही को और अधिक प्रभावी बनाया जा सके।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Give the definition of accountability. Discuss the reasoning behind the assertion given.
- Differentiate with responsibility in administrative and moral terms.
- Mention some recommendations from ARC to make administration more accountable.

Answer:

Accountability means to take ownership of the outcomes of an action and address the issues arising out of it fairly and promptly. Thus, it involves two parts: answerability as well as enforcement. Sometimes, transparency, which is the first step to extract accountability, is also included.

It is argued that accountability compromises efficiency by adding another bureaucratic layer:

- The officers spend their time in maintaining records or answering RTIs etc., which can otherwise be utilized to perform executive tasks.
- It makes them status quoist in their conduct. They may stop taking decisions for fear of public scrutiny.

However, accountability is one of the cornerstones of good governance. Evaluating the effectiveness of public officials/bodies ensures that they are performing to their full potential, providing value for money in the provision of public services, instilling confidence in the government and being responsive to the community they are meant to be serving.

An office which is accountable demonstrates commitment and sincerity to duty and is focused on achieving outcomes despite setbacks. It maintains a strong focus on the priorities and swiftly responds to changing requirements.

Difference between Accountability and Responsibility:

- In administrative parlance, responsibility refers to being in-charge of certain duties which are expected to be performed by virtue of being in a certain post/position. Accountability is one step ahead. It includes answerability, i.e. being liable for the outcomes achieved due to performance of the duty. Therefore, accountability can be held on to a person only after the task is done.
- For e.g. – A judge is responsible for delivering a judgment, but is not accountable if the outcomes are not as expected. A DM is both responsible as well as accountable for ensuring compliance with RTE in her district.
- In individualistic terms, responsibility can also refer to what one expects of oneself or the others. To be morally responsible for something, is to be worthy of particular kind of reaction, such as praise or blame in pursuance of the act.
- For e.g. helping a destitute is a responsibility of the affluent and empathetic. However, they cannot be held accountable for not helping them. They can be condemned, if one wishes so.
- Also, responsibility can be delegated but accountability cannot be.

Ensuring effective Accountability:

- Protection of Whistleblowers through legislation.

- Social Audits by local communities, NGOs can enhance accountability in public service delivery, for instance in MGNREGA.
- Using Information and Technology: electronic service delivery mechanisms and maintain digital records can revolutionize accountability.
- Encouraging Citizen's initiative: e.g. RTI being accessible in local languages.
- Promoting Competition and discouraging monopolistic attitude among public service sectors.

(b) "Morality is based neither on the principle of utility, nor on a law of nature, but on human reason. But human reason can be fallible." Comment., What does morality mean to you?

“नैतिकता न तो उपयोगिता के सिद्धांतों पर आधारित होती है और न ही प्रकृति के नियम पर, बल्कि यह मानवीय विवेक पर आधारित होती है। किंतु मानवीय विवेक दोषपूर्ण हो सकते हैं”। टिप्पणी कीजिए। आपके लिए नैतिकता का क्या अर्थ है?

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Explain the statement giving examples where human reason cannot decisively judge between what is good or bad.
- Give definition of morality, explain what it means to you by giving examples.

Answer:

It is through reasoning and logical thinking that man has been able to separate unjust from just and ethical from unethical; not on the basis of utility or law of nature. Human actions are based on reason, which guides us what we ought to do. The source from where we derive our reasoning can be religion, law, internal beliefs and values, etc.

As such, human reason is conditioned by a number of factors, such as existing political and social order. This leads to an act being decided as immoral by some while moral by others. For example, today, capital punishment is held as immoral by many countries and activists while there are many who reason for it as a retributive justice to some heinous crimes. Thus, depending upon the reasoning an act can be moral or immoral. We face number of dilemmas daily where reasoning creates conflict with the societal norms and ethics. Depending on new information, reasoning can thus change, making it fallible. Hence, it is true that morality if left to pure reason can be susceptible to fault.

Morality may be termed as principles concerning the distinction between right and wrong or good and bad behavior. It is a particular system of values and principles of conduct. Generally these principles are accepted by society at large, yet, they may be personal standards of an individual that he thinks are virtuous.

To me also, morality means taking a reasoned stand to differentiate good from bad. However, it should be open to new facts and alternate viewpoints which broaden the horizon of human reason. For example, speaking truth is considered moral universally. It may also be considered moral by an individual. However, for somebody who considers helping someone in need as greater moral principle may do so even if he needs to tell a lie for same.

Q.6. For effective public service delivery, the need today is to move from traditional accountability mechanisms to social accountability through greater civic engagement. Discuss with examples.

प्रभावी सार्वजनिक सेवा वितरण हेतु, जवाबदेहिता की पारंपरिक प्रणाली के स्थान पर अधिकाधिक नागरिक भागीदारी के माध्यम से सामाजिक जवाबदेही प्रणाली की ओर अग्रसर होना वर्तमान समय की आवश्यकता है। उदाहरण सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Explain social accountability in brief.
- Contrast it with traditional accountability and elaborate its advantage.
- Give some examples.

Answer:

Government business is so wide and complex that a check is needed upon its powers and activities. Accountability ensures actions and decisions taken by public officials are subject to oversight so as to guarantee that government initiatives meet their stated objectives and respond to the needs of the community they are meant to be benefiting, thereby contributing to better governance and poverty reduction. This check is provided by various accountability mechanisms. Traditional accountability mechanisms include legislative control, administrative control, judicial remedies, departmental hierarchies, vigilance mechanisms etc. However, such checks are generally of post hoc nature and less effective at the cutting edge level. This impacts the service delivery quality.

World Bank defines social accountability as an approach towards building accountability that relies on civic engagement, i.e., in which it is ordinary citizens and/or civil society organizations who participate directly or indirectly in exacting accountability. It involves the stakeholders like citizens, civil society, NGOs and others at various levels who engage in monitoring or evaluating a particular project, programme or policy, share control over the resources, provide feedback and take corrective actions when needed. Thus it mobilizes citizens at the local level to demand better services thus making the services more effective and economic as well. It brings in good governance while giving the community a sense of participation, ownership and empowerment.

Some examples of social accountability as implemented in various places include:

- Participatory Planning and Policy Formulation (Kerala, Brazil, Bangladesh);
- Participatory Budget Analysis (Gujarat);
- Participatory Expenditure Tracking System (Uganda, Delhi, Rajasthan);
- Citizens' Surveys/Citizen Report Cards (Bangalore, Maharashtra, Ukraine, Philippines, Pakistan);
- Citizen Charters (Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka); and
- Community Scorecards (Malawi, Maharashtra, Andhra Pradesh)

It has been well established that social accountability mechanisms can contribute to improved governance, accelerate development, and create effectiveness through better service delivery and empowerment. In addition to these methods and tools, many more exist such as campaigns for electoral reforms, public interest litigation, social audits, independent evaluation and so forth. At state level often janta durbar and mohalla sabha are organized to involve citizens more actively.

These initiatives are more effective when state's accountability mechanisms are transparent and citizen engaging. More importantly they ensure that a bottom up, demand driven approach is followed which ensures that grass root problems are effectively addressed. They have helped to bring in transparency, time bound service delivery, public participation at the stages of policy formulation, implementation and review, increased prudence, improving last mile outreach and brought a change in the attitude of bureaucracy.

Q.7. "A people that values its privileges above its principles soon loses both." What does this quotation mean to you? Explain with an example.

“वे लोग जो अपने सिद्धांतों की तुलना में विशेषाधिकारों को महत्व देते हैं, शीघ्र ही दोनों को खो देते हैं” आपके लिए इस उद्धरण का क्या अर्थ है? उदाहरण सहित व्याख्या कीजिए।

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- In brief discuss the meaning of principles and privileges.
- Then discuss how valuing privileges above principles is harmful for society.
- Explain it in the present context with relevant examples.

Answer:

Principles are deeply held beliefs that govern actions of an individual. A principle represents values that orient and rule the conduct of persons in a particular society. Principles are absorbed in childhood through the process of socialization.

Privilege is a special right or advantage available to a particular person or group of people. There are two sources of such privileges. One is external to the individual; the other is as a result of the principles.

However, when the principles cease to function, they cease to produce privileges. Increasing politicisation of social life is a defining feature of contemporary society. In politics, different sections of society contest for social issues/resources/dignity and struggle to have more privileges.

The struggle for claims promotes declining importance of principles in social conduct of citizen. It also leads to moral eclipse of individual and social groups which disturbs the peace and harmony in social order by creating conflict for resources.

Hence, the fundamental importance of asserting importance of principles is to prevent anarchy in society and its eventual decline. As said, by Gandhiji that a society where everyone values their duty, will automatically ensure their rights. There is rising expectation of people from their political system but ignorance towards the principles and duties derived from it. This asymmetry is disrupting and breeds conflicts. In this scenario, if citizens and social groups value the principles that govern a just society above its privileges, many of above conflicts can be resolved.

Q.8. Value of compassion towards the weak extends the limits of operations of a public servant by introducing flexibility but dilutes the principle of objectivity. Discuss. If a conflict arises between the value of compassion and principle of objectivity, how will you deal with it as a public servant?

कमजोर के प्रति करुणा की भावना रखने की महत्ता किसी लोक सेवक के कार्यक्षेत्र की सीमाओं में लोचशीलता लाकर उसे विस्तारित करती है, किंतु वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत को निर्बल करती है। चर्चा कीजिए। यदि करुणा की महत्ता और वस्तुनिष्ठता के सिद्धांत के बीच संघर्ष पैदा होता है तो एक लोक सेवक के रूप में आप इस परिस्थिति से किस प्रकार निपटेंगे?

(Marks:10, 150 words)

Approach:

- Explain the values of compassion and objectivity.
- Elaborate whether such a conflict exists.
- If there is no conflict, then explain why it is so else suggest action to address it.

Answer:

A public servant needs to be compassionate so that he is concerned by the misfortunes and sufferings of unprivileged.

Compassion motivates him to go out of way to help the weak. For this he may have to be flexible in his actions and work around the rules rather than working within it strictly. However, this can affect his objectivity.

Objectivity means that a public servant's decisions and acts should be based on merit and fairness. It entails respect, equality, and fairness. It doesn't matter whether someone has money or not, they must be treated fairly.

However, while working to help some weaker section he can project himself to be biased towards them. Also, some policy or decision may prove to be uneconomical or not useful and even antagonistic to some better off population, but he may want to carry it forward so as to help the needful. Also, if his decision proves to be wrong in hindsight he may invite disciplinary action for tinkering with the rules. Thus, it may lead to a conflict laden situation.

In such a situation, following path can be followed:

- Invoke one's conscience and decide whether the action is needed or not.
- Deliberating whether the act of compassion is not detrimental to the interest of public.
- Deviation from rules should be as less as possible and appropriate reasons for any deviation should be communicated to the senior authorities beforehand and in case of paucity of time, as soon as possible.
- The learning from the experience should be utilized to create rule based mechanism so that any such situation does not lead to conflict for oneself or any other official in the future.

SECTION – B

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow:

Q.9. You are SP of a district where the use of drugs is prevalent, especially among the youth. The neighbouring districts are also suffering from the same problem. There is a huge hue and cry in the national media about the drug issue and the government and political parties are pressurising the police and district administration to act on the issue. A big deal of drugs is busted by the police in your area and all the culprits have been arrested. However, even before you reach your office, a minister from the ruling party of the state calls and asks you to release few of the culprits. You have long suspected the role of many senior leaders in this drug menace of the state. You have also been informed by your juniors that a few officers who dared to act against people involved in drug dealings were transferred or suspended on wrong charges earlier.

1. Identify the options available to you.

2. Evaluate the pros and cons of each of your options.

आप एक ऐसे जिले के एस.पी. हैं जहां मादक पदार्थों का व्यापक उपयोग होता है। विशेष रूप से युवाओं के बीच यह सर्वाधिक प्रचलित है। पड़ोसी जिले भी इसी समस्या से ग्रसित हैं। मादक पदार्थों से जुड़े मुद्दों के संबंध में राष्ट्रीय मीडिया में हायतौबा मची है और इस मुद्दे पर कार्यवाही करने के लिए सरकार और राजनीतिक दल, पुलिस एवं जिला प्रशासन पर दबाव डाल रहे हैं। आपके क्षेत्र में मादक पदार्थों की एक बड़ी डील का पुलिस द्वारा भंडाफोड़ किया जाता है। हालांकि इससे पहले कि आप अपने कार्यालय पहुंचते, राज्य के सत्तारूढ़ दल का एक मंत्री आप को बुलाता है और कुछ अपराधियों को छोड़ने के लिए कहता है। आप लंबे समय से राज्य में मादक पदार्थ से जुड़े इस खतरे में कई वरिष्ठ नेताओं की भूमिका पर संदेह करते रहे हैं। आपको, आपके कनिष्ठों द्वारा सूचित किया जाता है कि मादक पदार्थों की डीलिंग में सम्मिलित लोगों के विरुद्ध कार्यवाही करने का साहस जुटाने वाले कुछ अधिकारियों को पूर्व में गलत आरोपों में स्थानांतरित या निलंबित किया जा चुका है।

1. स्वयं के समक्ष उपलब्ध विकल्पों की पहचान कीजिए?

2. अपने प्रत्येक विकल्पों के पक्ष-विपक्ष का मूल्यांकन कीजिए?**(Marks:20, 250 words)****Approach:**

- List the facts of the case along with stakeholders.
- Mention the ethical issues involved.
- Discuss the available options with their merits and demerits, based on ethical standards and practical considerations.
- Finally, write the best course of action available.

Answer:**Facts of the case**

- Drug menace is a prevalent in the society and there is huge pressure on the administration to act.
- A deal of drugs was busted and criminals caught.
- There is an informal demand from the minister to release some of those caught.

The stakeholders of the case are SP himself, his department, the political dispensation (the minister) and the pressure groups – media and society at large.

The ethical issues involved in the case:

- Responsibility to act against a social menace.
- Public service values and maintaining integrity of the office prone to political influence.
- Consequences of actions and inactions which have the potential to change discourse
- Political corruption and nexus between leaders and criminals

Options available and their evaluation**1. Follow the minister's instructions:****i. Merits:**

- a) Potential personal gain for the SP by virtue of being a 'Yes Man' to the minister. By not following the order he can be transferred or even suspended on wrong charges.
- b) Only some culprits will be released – the media and society can be shown the 'successes' of administration in catching others.

ii. Demerits:

- a) Shows lack of courage to act against the real culprits. Catching the 'small fish' is just a facesaving exercise.
- b) The real problem of drugs will still continue unabated, with lives of youth destroyed.

2. Ask the minister to send his order in writing:

i. Merit: This will give the demand a formal character of request. It will carry more legitimacy and this could be held up against the minister if questions arise later. Moreover, there may be a possibility that the culprits in question were secret government moles, as is frequent in such cases, who helped bust the racket.

ii. Demerit: Chance of a written order is less and the SP may face retribution for not 'falling in line'.

3. Go to the media with the bust and also reveal political pressure to release some:

i. Merit: It may create a significant political pressure on the ruling party to take action on the minister. It may also lead to an enquiry committee regarding the nexus between politicians and criminal groups.

ii. Demerit: It may remain limited to mere sensationalization and nothing concrete happens. As SP doesn't have enough proof to present his case, and he is not aware about the extent of the political involvement, instead of exposing the entire racket this option may invite the wrath of the state.

4. Go ahead with the arrest:

i. Merit: It shows courage to do what is right and necessary to deal with situation. It also shows integrity of the officer and commitment to duty.

ii. Demerit: Same as option 2.

The best course of action will be a combination of option 2 and 4, i.e. asking the minister to give request in writing, with reasons of the demand, and if that is not obliged, go ahead with the arrest. Meanwhile, I will continue my investigation and will gather evidences against all the stakeholders of the drug trade. Further, as a law enforcement officer, my duty lies in preventing all the illegal practices. My allegiance lies to the constitution and laws duly framed, not to the whims of any person, howsoever powerful he/she may be.

Q.10. You are the manager of a small hotel which maintains high standards of ethics in dealing with its customers. One day a person comes to your hotel and enquires about booking a room at your hotel. However, due to peak season, all rooms were already booked and hence the staff politely informed him about the unavailability. The person, however, was adamant and took this as a personal insult and started misbehaving with the staff present at the counter. Citing his political connection he also threatened the staff of severe consequences. Next day the person lodged a frivolous complaint with the police under the stringent SC/ST act. In his complaint he accused you and your staff of insulting him deliberately on the basis of his caste. He insisted further that he was denied a room at your hotel due to the caste he belongs to.

1. What are the options available to you?

2. Evaluate each of these options and choose the option which you would adopt, giving reasons.

आप एक छोटे से होटल के प्रबंधक हैं जिसका अपने ग्राहकों द्वारा व्यवहार का उच्च नैतिक मानक है। एक दिन एक व्यक्ति आपके होटल में आता है और आप से होटल में कमरा बुक करने के संबंध में पूछताछ करता है। हालांकि पीक सीजन होने के कारण सभी कमरे पहले से ही बुक हैं और इसलिए कर्मचारी विनम्रता पूर्वक उसे अनुपलब्धता के संबंध में सूचित करता है। लेकिन वह व्यक्ति हठी था और इसे व्यक्तिगत अपमान के रूप में ले लेता है और काउंटर पर उपस्थित कर्मचारियों के साथ दुर्व्यवहार पर उतर आता है। अपने राजनीतिक संबंधों का हवाला देते हुए वह कर्मचारियों को गंभीर परिणाम की धमकी देता है। अगले दिन, वह व्यक्ति कठोर एससी/एसटी अधिनियम के तहत पुलिस के पास झूठी शिकायत दर्ज करवाता है। अपनी शिकायत में वह आप पर और आपके कर्मचारियों पर अपनी जाति के आधार पर जानबूझकर अपमान करने का आरोप लगाता है। वह आगे कहता है कि वह जिस जाति से संबंध रखता है, उसके कारण उसे आपके होटल में कमरा देने से मना किया गया था।

1. आपके समक्ष उपलब्ध विकल्प क्या हैं?

2. इनमें से प्रत्येक विकल्प का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और स्वयं द्वारा चुने जाने वाले विकल्प का कारण बताइए।

(Marks:20, 250 words)

Approach:

- First briefly discuss the stakeholders and ethical issues of the case.
- Then discuss the various options which are available to you both at the time of incident and after the complain. Discuss the merits and demerits of these options based on ethical and practical considerations.
- Finally, provide a reasonable solution with proper reasoning.

Answer

The case involves various issues like misuse of SC/ST act on the part of customer, threatening, and unruly behavior. As the hotel manager, I have to handle the matter delicately.

1) While the person is at the counter, the possible actions include

- Not paying any heed to his remarks and asking him to leave the hotel.
- Pacifying him and convincing him about the non-availability of rooms.
- Helping him to find an accommodation at some nearby hotel in the spirit of customer service.
- Calling the police helpline.

Options available when he files a false complaint:

- Opting for mediation.
- Holding the concerned staff directly responsible for the incidence and removing them to avoid legal trouble.
- Allowing the law to take its own course and cooperating with the investigation agencies for a fair assessment.
- Approach the relevant competent authority to seek quashing of the frivolous complaint.

2) Evaluation of the above options

Not paying any heed and asking him to leave will be insensitive and unprofessional and will go against the high standards of ethical values which the hotel maintains.

Pacifying the customer to apprise him of the real situation by means of possible proof like booking– records is important. This will help in addressing his apprehensions about any bias towards him. Helping him in finding an alternate accommodation will be consistent with the high regards the hotel pays to its customers.

Calling the police can be an extreme step, but may be required if the person behaves inappropriately.

Mediation as an option even when the hotel is not at fault is worth giving a try. It can remove any apprehensions the person may have due to the adverse behaviour of any of the staff member

Allowing law to take its own course is also an option. Under the SC/ST Act since the onus to prove guilt lies on the accused, so as a manager I will cooperate with the authorities to provide all the relevant details.

Moving the high court for quashing the false complaint is also an option worth considering if I do not get a relief from the session/district court.

My course of action

I will first try to pacify the person and apprise him of the difficulties in allotting him a room at the hotel. I will try to help him in all possible ways to find a room. However if his behaviour is contrary to the civil standards, I will not hesitate to call the police as a precautionary measure.

When the person files a false complaint, first I will opt for mediation and alley his misunderstandings, if any. In case he does not relent, I will challenge all the allegations in the District/Session court having the area jurisdiction and will ensure that the false complaint is quashed. Thereafter, I will file a complaint for defamation apart from a suit to claim damages on account of the false accusations.

Q.11. As a Forest Officer, you are receiving increasing complaints of certain animals ruining the farms and causing damage to crops. This is creating an undue financial burden for the farmers who are in deep distress because of the uncontrolled damage. Consequently, the farmers are demanding you to put forward a request for culling of animals. You are an animal lover and against culling of animals. You had made efforts to control the menace but the population of animals has increased beyond the managing capacity.

1. What are the options available to you? Evaluate each of these options and choose the option which you would adopt, giving reasons.

2. Also suggest some long term measures to ensure that such a situation is not repeated.

एक वन अधिकारी के रूप में, आपको कुछ जानवरों द्वारा खेतों को बर्बाद करने और फसलों को क्षतिग्रस्त करने की बढ़ रही शिकायतें मिलती हैं। यह ऐसे किसानों पर अनुचित वित्तीय बोझ डाल रहा है जो अनियंत्रित क्षति के कारण गहरे संकट में हैं। परिणाम स्वरूप किसान, जानवरों को मारने के लिए आपसे अपने वरिष्ठों से अनुरोध करने की मांग कर रहे हैं। आप पशु प्रेमी हैं और जानवरों को मारने के विरुद्ध हैं। आप उक्त समस्या को नियंत्रित करने का प्रयास कर चुके हैं लेकिन जानवरों की आबादी, प्रबंधन क्षमता से अधिक बढ़ गई है।

(1) आपके समक्ष उपलब्ध विकल्प क्या है? इन उपलब्ध विकल्पों में से प्रत्येक का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और बताइए कि आप किस विकल्प को चुनेंगे? अपने उत्तर के पक्ष में तर्क दीजिए।

(2) इसके साथ ही, यह सुनिश्चित करने के लिए कि ऐसी स्थिति की पुनरावृत्ति न हो, कुछ दीर्घकालिक उपायों का सुझाव दीजिए।

(Marks:20, 250 words)

Approach:

- Explain the facts of the case.
- Then describe the ethical issues involved.
- Further examine the options available to you. Evaluate these options and explain why you would choose a particular option. Give reasons to justify your stand.
- Suggest some long term measures.

Answer:

Facts of the case:

- Economic losses to farmers due to unmanageable number of animals destroying crops.
- Culling of animal is being demanded.
- Issue of rights of animal.

Ethical issues: Officer is torn between economic losses faced by farmers and upholding right of the animals to live & maintaining ecological balance of the area. Also, it is the man which is responsible for such a conflict as he has expanded into territory of animals in greed of resources.

Options Available

- Culling of animals.
It will provide immediate relief and prevent the menace as of now. But, it is not a sustainable solution as new animals will take their pace. Further it will encourage farmers to further expand farmlands into forest areas believing that animals will be taken care of by the government. Also, it is unethical to kill animals for no fault of theirs as it is human who has encroached upon their lands. Also, it may disturb the ecological balance of the area.
- Fencing and other measures to restrict entry of animals.
However, not be a foolproof solution as it may not control all animals. It will be costly affair.

- Banning Deforestation
- Deforestation and lowered green cover in cities has been driving animals into crop fields and human dwellings in search of food. Hence, put forward request for banning deforestation in the area. Involve community through education and awareness measures. Focus on increasing yield from existing land. It may be a time consuming process and will result in loss to farmers. Also, the farmers may not agree to this as they might desire forest land to be diverted to farms. Identifying natural calamities and other reasons.

For instance, drought dries up availability of food for foraging driving wild animals into nearby crop fields. Hence, making food available to the animals at different location will prevent such invasion. However, costly and not a foolproof plan. Best course of action would be to:

Fence the existing land, creating awareness about deforestation and its negative impact, focus on increasing yield and culling of animals who are not being prevented through fencing.

Long Term Solutions

- Culling wild animals by declaring them vermin is not the long-term solution to human-animal conflict; sterilising them is a better solution.
- Scientific management of wild animals should necessarily involve population control.
- Animal census is conducted outside protected areas to understand why certain species are entering into greater conflict with humans.
- Identifying human activities such as poaching of predator species. It is important to control them which can keep the vermin population in check.

Q.12. You are the Health Secretary in a state where there is an outbreak of dengue and chikungunya diseases. There have been reports of negligent attitude of some private hospitals in the city. Also, the public hospitals do not have the required infrastructure and staff to meet such increased number of cases in a short span of time. Additionally, the staff is demoralised by the increased working hours and the public outrage. Despite the efforts of the local authorities this issue emerges year after year.

1. What are the immediate steps which should be taken in such a situation?

2. Suggest some long term measures to ensure that such a situation is not repeated.

आप एक ऐसे राज्य में स्वास्थ्य सचिव हैं जहां डेंगू और चिकनगुनिया रोगों का प्रकोप है। शहर में कुछ निजी अस्पतालों के उपेक्षा भरे रवैए की भी सूचना है। इसके साथ ही, सरकारी अस्पतालों में इतने कम समय में इन मामलों की इतनी बड़ी संख्या का सामना करने के लिए आवश्यक अवसंरचना और कर्मचारी नहीं हैं। इसके अतिरिक्त, कर्मचारी काम के घंटे में वृद्धि और जनता के आक्रोश से हतोत्साहित हैं। स्थानीय प्राधिकरण के प्रयासों के बावजूद यह समस्या वर्ष दर वर्ष बढ़ती जा रही है।

1. ऐसी स्थिति में उठाए जा सकने वाले तात्कालिक कदम क्या होंगे?

2. यह सुनिश्चित करने के लिए कि ऐसी स्थिति की पुनरावृत्ति न हो, कुछ दीर्घकालिक उपायों का सुझाव दीजिए।

(Marks:20, 250 words)

Approach:

- List the immediate steps that should be taken in the given situation. Discuss what needs to be done immediately to tackle the situation.
- Then suggest some long term measures that should be taken to ensure that such a situation does not arise again.

Answer:

The increased incidents of Dengue and Chikungunya is not only a health issue but also a major administrative challenge and calls for instant action to stop the disease from creating a havoc amongst the public.

Immediate steps

- Vector transmission is reduced through the use or combination of Environmental Management and Medical Supervision.

Medical Supervision

- Mohalla Clinics should be expanded to distribute the work load and increase the capacity to tackle such cases instantly and near the homes of the patients. This will also control the crowding of hospitals.
- Medical hotlines to provide timely information of medical treatment, directing the patient to the well-equipped hospitals.

- The medical staff must be motivated through financial incentives for working overtime. Additional medical support should also be arranged to reduce work load.
- Giving strict instructions and ensuring effective monitoring of the hospitals so that no patient is turned away. This requires prompt grievance redressal mechanism.

Environmental Management

- Social mobilization, advocacy and legislation must be coordinated to reduce the incidents and increase awareness. Using print and electronic media for the same.
- Increased fumigation drives and awareness campaigns in mass media to reduce the incidents.

Long Term Measures

- We do need to step up the speed and effectiveness of our crisis response but, even more important, we need to raise the steady state efficiency of the health system so that crises are avoided, or are minor at worst.
- It calls for well-coordinated prevention measures that link multiple civic services, government agencies and community organisations; efficient surveillance systems that help in forecasting and monitoring; and concerted clinical care strategies that intelligently draw upon the combined resources of public and private providers.
- Through a combination of effective prevention measures and application of a standardised clinical management protocol, these incidents can be reduced. It should be the priority to invest in creating health systems that prioritise prevention and promote competent and compassionate clinical care.
- Appropriate, timely and effective risk communication to the public is required. Well-informed citizens will not only be able to make the right decisions about the care they seek but can also be a collective community resource to practise and promote prevention.

Q.13. You are DM of a very poor district in the hinterland of India. It has come to your notice that manual scavenging is widely prevalent in the district even though the new law prohibits manual scavenging in any form. Upon enquiry, you have found that the number of manual scavengers has been reported to be very low, however, hundreds of dry latrines in the district depict a different picture. You have also noticed two more important trends: first, most of the manual scavengers are Dalits, and second, in many of the cases they themselves go to the houses and request the owners to clean their toilets manually, as it would provide monetary benefits. The entire district administration has been criticized by the media and there is political pressure on you to manipulate the data in a way that it shows less number of manual scavengers in the district. Based on the given information answer the following:

1. Identify the ethical issues associated with manual scavenging.
2. List the options available to you in the given case. Evaluate the merits and demerits of each.
3. Discuss some feasible steps that you can take to control this serious problem.

आप भारत के अंदरूनी क्षेत्र में एक बहुत ही पिछड़े जिले के डी.एम. हैं। आपको यह पता चला है कि कानून द्वारा किसी भी रूप में मैला ढोने की प्रथा पर प्रतिबंध लगाए जाने के बावजूद जिले में यह व्यापक रूप से प्रचलित है। पूछताछ करने पर आपको ज्ञात होता है कि मैला ढोने वालों की संख्या बहुत कम बताई गई है, जबकि जिले में सैकड़ों शुष्क शौचालय अलग ही तस्वीर प्रस्तुत करते हैं। आप दो अन्य महत्वपूर्ण प्रवृत्तियों का भी अवलोकन करते हैं। पहला, अधिकांश मैला ढोने वाले दलित हैं और दूसरा, कई प्रकरणों में, वे स्वयं घरों में जाते हैं और गृहस्वामियों से उनका शौचालय हाथ से साफ करने का अनुरोध करते हैं क्योंकि इससे मौद्रिक लाभ होगा। संपूर्ण जिला प्रशासन की मीडिया द्वारा आलोचना की गई है। इस कारण आप पर आंकड़ों में इस प्रकार से हेरफेर करने का राजनीतिक दबाव है जिससे जिले में मैला ढोने वालों की कम संख्या का पता चले। दी गई जानकारी के आधार पर निम्नलिखित का उत्तर दीजिए।

1. मैला ढोने से संबंधित नैतिक मुद्दों को चिन्हित कीजिए।
2. दिए गए प्रकरण में आप स्वयं के लिए उपलब्ध विकल्पों को सूचीबद्ध कीजिए। प्रत्येक विकल्प के गुणों-अवगुणों का मूल्यांकन कीजिए।
3. आपके द्वारा इस गंभीर समस्या को नियंत्रित करने के लिए उठाए जा सकने वाले कुछ व्यावहारिक कदमों की चर्चा कीजिए।

(Marks:20, 250 words)

Approach:

- First discuss the ethical issues with manual scavenging in detail. Discuss the moral dimensions of the problem.
- In the given scenario, discuss few options which can be implemented with the merits and demerits of each of them. Also, mention the best course of action to be adopted.
- Provide a long term strategy to solve the manual scavenging.

Answer:

About 72 years since we have had an egalitarian constitution in operation, it is embarrassing to know that many are forced to clean the excreta of others to earn their daily bread; i.e. manual scavenging.

1. Ethical issues associated with manual scavenging

- **Human dignity:** In India, people give importance to their dignity more than their life. In such a situation manual scavengers are forced to live an undignified life by cleaning the excreta as highlighted in the case.
- **Health Hazards:** They are not only deprived of a dignified life but also deprived of healthy living conditions. Due to the nature of the job, many of the workers have related health problems.
- **Caste discrimination:** Manual scavenging is traditionally a role determined by the outlawed caste system for members of the Dalit caste. This reflects a clear-cut image that India is still suffocating with the evils of caste system.
- **Issues in implementation of various laws:** Even though there came various legislations and judicial proceedings to curb manual scavenging, it is prevalent in many parts of the country due to the lack of bona fide implementation of governmental policies as this case suggests. It is unfortunate to see that the law remains as a paper tiger.

2. Options available

a. Report low number of manual scavengers

i. **Merit:** It will ease the pressure on me from political establishment as well from media. I can work towards this serious issue without any pressure. It will also present a good picture of the district in the media.

ii. **Demerit:** The picture presented will be based on fabrication of data which is against organizational ethics and also shows lack of empathy for manual scavengers. It also shows lack of courage and lack of dedication to public services where the DM is trying to wriggle out of his responsibility instead of solving the problem. It gives a false sense of reconciling with reality.

b. Go to the media with actual numbers

i. **Merit:** The issue will be highlighted in the media and the pressure on the government will increase. It may become more serious about the problem with more funds allotted to solve the problem.

ii. **Demerit:** However, this will be against the civil services conduct. It may only sensationalize the issue rather than providing a concrete solution. This option should only be utilized if the political establishment is adamant on fabrication of data.

c. Resist all the attempts of fabrication of data and work for the elimination of manual scavenging:

i. **Merit:** This shows dedication to the welfare of the most marginalized section of society on one hand and also shows integrity and courage on the part of DM.

ii. **Demerit:** This may hamper the relationship between DM and political leaders and can affect his future promotions.

I will choose the third option to tackle the current conundrum. This is not a case of moral ambivalence as I have to choose between personal gains and professional integrity. The key to solving any problem is to first identify the problem and its magnitude. With proper recognition, appropriate planning can be done and outcomes evaluated against baseline.

3. Steps to eliminate manual scavenging

For the manual scavenger, it is the economic necessity that drives him/her to perform this act. For the beneficiary of cleaning, the general citizen, it is their attitude (mostly derived from caste based social status) which makes them ignorant about the problem. This perpetuates their exploitation.

Enforcement of law in letter and spirit is required to create deterrence in society against manual scavenging. Measures for an attitudinal change in society need to be initiated to bring awareness about this undignified practice. For rehabilitation, alternative employment to manual scavengers and free education and health services to their family members will ensure that scavenging is not done manually.

As a DM of the district, I will ensure that all public and school latrines are equipped with proper flushing facilities. Manholes need to be cleaned using machines and not hand. Open defecation needs to be banned. Apart from funds, all this requires a societal movement. I will involve like-minded citizens and local NGOs to increase awareness. Advertisements at prominent places will help. I will ensure mandatory attendance of children of such people in school so that even in the worst case, this hereditary livelihood is not passed on. Working closely with the police department can lead to effective curbing of the practice.

Q.14. You are a Secretary in a government department. Your Minister has proposed an unemployment grant, which is expected to cost the public exchequer heavily. Having already taken the decision, he asks you to come up with research to support the scheme. Despite your best efforts, you fail to find socio-economic benefit in it. You approach the Minister

with relevant facts and studies and ask him to reconsider his decision. Instead, he asks you to suppress the negative impacts and actively promote the scheme through mass media as the perceived social impacts are more important than economic impacts.

Elections are due in a short time and the political party currently in power is expected to win. You are also due for promotion at the same time. You are expected to fully cooperate in the situation and make the scheme a success, however flawed its foundations may be.

(a) List the different stakeholders in the above situation and mention their prospective interests.

(b) Discuss the ethical dilemma which you face in this situation.

(c) Some of the alternatives for you to handle the situation could be:

- Do as asked by the Minister..
- Insist on publication of results and let the public decide whether it wants the scheme.
- Call a press conference and brief the media about the results and the callous attitude of the Minister.

Suggest any other possible option(s). Evaluate all of them and suggest the best course of action, giving reasons for it.

आप एक सरकारी विभाग में सचिव हैं। आपके मंत्री ने बेरोजगारी भत्ता का प्रस्ताव स्वीकृत किया है, जिससे सरकारी खजाने पर अत्यधिक बोझ पड़ने की संभावना है। क्योंकि उन्होंने पहले ही से ही इस पर निर्णय ले लिया है अतः वे इस योजना के समर्थन में आपसे शोध करके आने को कहते हैं। आपके द्वारा सर्वोत्तम प्रयास किए जाने के बावजूद भी आपको इसमें कोई सामाजिक-आर्थिक लाभ दिखाई नहीं पड़ रहा है। आप संबंधित तथ्यों और अध्ययनों के साथ मंत्री के पास जाते हैं और उनसे अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने का आग्रह करते हैं। क्योंकि इस योजना के कथित सामाजिक प्रभाव, आर्थिक प्रभाव की अपेक्षा अधिक महत्वपूर्ण हैं, अतः अपने निर्णय पर पुनर्विचार करने की अपेक्षा वे आपसे इसके नकारात्मक प्रभाव को छिपाने और इस योजना को जनसंचार माध्यम की सहायता से सक्रिय रूप से प्रचारित करने को कहते हैं।

कुछ समय बाद चुनाव होने वाले हैं और वर्तमान सत्तारूढ़ दल के जीतने की संभावना है। इसी समय आपकी प्रोन्नति भी होनी है। आपसे इस स्थिति में पूर्ण रूप से सहयोग करने और इस योजना को सफल बनाने की अपेक्षा है, भले ही इसका आधार त्रुटिपूर्ण हो।

(a) उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में विभिन्न हितधारकों की सूची प्रदान कीजिए और उनके संभावित हितों का उल्लेख कीजिए।

(b) इस परिस्थिति में आपके समक्ष उत्पन्न नैतिक दुविधा की चर्चा कीजिए?

(c) इस परिस्थिति से निपटने के लिए आपके पास कुछ विकल्प हो सकते हैं

- जैसा मंत्री ने कहा वैसा कीजिए...
 - परिणामों को प्रकाशित करने का आग्रह कीजिए और जनता को निर्णय करने दीजिए कि वह इस योजना को चाहती है या नहीं
 - एक प्रेस कान्फ्रेंस कीजिए और इस योजना के परिणाम तथा मंत्री के संवेदनहीन रवैये के बारे में मीडिया को संक्षिप्त वृत्तांत दीजिए
- कोई अन्य संभव विकल्प समझाइए। उन सभी का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और अपने कारण बताते हुए उनमें से सबसे अच्छे विकल्प को सुझाव दीजिए।

(Marks:20, 250 words)

Approach:

- List the facts of the case, mention various stakeholders. The prospective interest must be inferred from the facts. Avoid giving unverifiable opinions.
- Bring out the ethical dilemma faced.
- Evaluate all the available options – mention their merits and demerits.
- Give the course of action. Try to address the demerits mentioned and evolve a comprehensive solution.

Answer:

Facts of the case:

- The proposed unemployment grant will cost the exchequer heavily.
- Detailed study about the proposed scheme shows net negative socio-economic impact. The minister has refused to reconsider the decision.
- Elections are due in a short time. My promotion is also due at the same time.

From above facts, it can be argued that although the minister is himself not engaging in corruption, he is using the loopholes of the system to fulfill his electoral compulsions.

a) Different stakeholders and their prospective interests

- **Secretary:** As a civil servant, it is his duty to give honest opinion to the political executive. However, once a decision is taken, he should implement it whole heartedly. Not obeying legal and legitimate orders amounts to dereliction of duty. Also, it will portray him as non-flexible and show him in poor light. Defying orders may jeopardize his career prospects also.
- **Minister:** Successful implementation of scheme will probably bring electoral gains for his party.

- **Beneficiaries of the grant (unemployed people):** They may benefit in the short run, but as the scheme does not have a positive socio-economic impact, real benefits may be scarce.
- **General public:** Taxpayers money should be spent effectively and the executive should be held accountable for it. The public has an interest in knowing the efficacy of the expenditure.

b) Ethical dilemma faced

As a civil servant unsatisfied with the decision of the political executive, I face the dilemma of whether or not to honestly implement a scheme from which I am certain no positive will come out. As an implementing agency, I will be held accountable for the success/failure of the scheme. Since I am convinced that this scheme will lead to waste of public money, I will have to choose between larger public interest and self-interest. Thus, the dilemma is choosing between something which is legally right v/s other which is morally right in the light of public interest.

c) Alternatives available to me**i. Do as asked by the Minister.**

Merits: I will be abiding in letter to the duty to implement the will of the political executive. Steadfastly implementing the scheme will also reflect my commitment to duty and will further my career prospects.

Demerits: Will lead to the wastage of public money and breach of the trust of public in the government. Also, I will face cognitive dissonance and may not be able to keep myself motivated during the implementation.

ii. Insist on publication of results and let the public decide whether it wants the scheme.

Merits: Adherence to transparency is the cornerstone of good governance. It will help the public to choose what is best for them. It will encourage people's participation in decision making and may set a precedent for all schemes in the future.

Demerits: As soon as the issue comes in public domain, the narrative will be hijacked by political compulsions and any rollback would become exceedingly impossible. Changes which could have been made earlier would now become more difficult. Public discussion will also entail substantial expenditure and time.

iii. Call a press conference and brief the media about the results and the callous attitude of the Minister.

Merits: Will bring the matter into the public domain and expose the callous decision making process. It may force the minister to reconsider.

Demerits: Media briefing will be against the principle of anonymity and secrecy. Such steps should be taken when all other remedies have been exhausted and when the case is of personal or organizational corruption. Moreover, I may be seen as being excessively stubborn, if not in open defiance of authority.

Course of action :

Foremost, I will try to modify the scheme to make it more prudent and effective. I will put honest comments for consideration to make my views clear. Further, I will try to convince the minister of getting the public opinion before going ahead with the scheme. This will be achieved through publication of the broad outlines and engaging in public discussions. Rather than being hijacked politically, wise handling of the issue can in fact bring positive feedback for the government. In the process, I can also improve my understanding of the socio-economic needs of the people. Once the public opinion is incorporated, I will implement the scheme with dedication.